

THE TEACHERS' PERCEPTION ON BILINGUAL EDUCATION PROGRAM AT AN INDONESIAN SENIOR HIGH SCHOOL

Lisa Said, Muhammad Basri Djafar, Mansur Akil, Iskandar

ABSTRACT

The aim of this study is to provide information about the perceptions of teachers regarding the attributes of bilingual education program. The researcher employed a qualitative descriptive research method using an ethnographic study of a Senior High School in a city in the province of South Sulawesi, Indonesia. The subject of the research was 3 teachers and the instruments of the research consisted of tentative protocol interview, field notes, observation and document analysis. Interactive Model was used to analyze the qualitative data collected.

The results showed that English teacher felt program articulation is the most important attribute of bilingual education program. The teacher felt leadership, vision, and goals and quality people are the second most important attributes. Followed by the parental and community involvement, creation of classroom climate, and curriculum and instruction attributes. The teacher felt organization, accountability, and assessment is the least important attribute of bilingual education program. Economics teacher felt program articulation is the most important attribute of bilingual education program. The teacher felt parental and community involvement and curriculum and instruction are the second most important attributes. Followed by the quality people, creation of classroom climate, and leadership, vision, and goals attributes. The teacher felt organization, accountability, and assessment are the least important attribute of bilingual education program. Mathematics teacher felt parental and community involvement is the most important attribute of bilingual education program. The teacher felt the creation of classroom climate and program articulation are the second and third most important attributes, followed by the curriculum and instruction and quality people attributes. The teacher felt organization, accountability, and assessment and leadership, vision, and goals are the least attributes of bilingual education program,

Key words: Teachers' Perception, Bilingual Education Program.

INTRODUCTION

The part of globalization era that has emergent implication for teachers is the huge moving of citizen from one place to another. This people movement is caused by many aspects: the need for good economic situation, the labors' need, the number of refugees resulting from conflicts between groups, or dangerous ecological disaster (Cummins, 2000).

Robertson (2008) describes the globalization as the stressing issue of the world and the activities of the consideration of the world. This description is implemented in everyday interaction of the the information flow. It can be seen in intelligence switch that human examine global perception. The teachers have to make proper model to prepare chances to improve teachers' global and multicultural conscious. Many ways were done to relate students with the human from another country by using handphone or internet tool. Globalization is very important part to the future to explore the comprehending of the human and then improve an obligation to a global world. Global issues are important attention to the people in every country.

Teachers and stake holder in education field have stress global perception in the teaching and learning process in the classroom to strengthen meaningful perspective of global information and responsibilities (Smith, M. K., & Doyle, M. E, 2007). Educators ought to be told citizens responsibilities of international attention and controversies, so that they may provide their students for global challenges context.

The existing of Bilingual Education Program in this current day has created debate

and study to decide the benefit of Bilingual Education Program, the most suitable models of Bilingual Education Program, and the attributes of Bilingual Education Program. The review of the reference assumes that Bilingual Education Program is crucial to the students (Cummins, 1999; Krashen, 2000). Since 1973, a few countries have given suitable funding for Bilingual Education Program to help students. Based on Texas Administrative Code (TEA, 2000), the single student in the country who has a language other than English and who is found as an English Language Learner have to be prepared with enough chance to involve in a Bilingual Education Program/English as a Foreign Language (EFL) program.

Since most studies have focused on what individual schools have done to successfully educate increasing numbers of students, attention should also be focused on the changes that must occur to create equity and excellence for all students. Therefore, additional research is needed to examine the perceptions of teachers regarding the attributes of bilingual education program.

LITERATURE REVIEW

Previous qualitative and quantitative researches have been done in schools where students have experienced high levels of academic success (August & Hakuta, 1998; Howard et al., 2003; Rennie, 1993; Robledo Montecel, Cortez, & Cortez, 2002). The following seven attributes have been found to be parts of bilingual education programs: (1) leadership, vision, and goals, (2) creation of classroom climate, (3) program articulation, (4) organization, accountability, and assessment, (5) quality people, (6) parental and community involvement, and (7) curriculum and instruction. While many of the attributes from the various studies intersect with each other, none of the studies included the same list of attributes. The attributes that presented in this research represented a holistic combination of salient characteristics that provided a comprehensive framework through which the perceptions of teachers were examined.

The first attribute of effective bilingual education program relates to leadership, vision, and goals. Educational leaders who are well informed of the rationale for bilingual education and share an active commitment to bilingualism are critical to the effective schooling of students. Effective leaders proactively involve teachers, the community, and the private sector in the design and development of the bilingual program and are open to innovation (Carter & Chatfield, 1986; E. E. Garcia, 1991; Goldenberg & Sullivan, 1994; Lucas, Henze, & Donato, 1990; Tikunoff et al., 1991). One of the primary roles of the leader is to create a vision and set of goals with the school community that define high expectations of all students. Furthermore, these high expectations are published and disseminated so that staff, parents, and students can articulate the purpose of the school in their own words (Robledo Montecel, Cortez, Cortez et al., 2002; Villarreal & Solís, 1998). In order to lead stakeholders in the development and support of an effective bilingual education program, educational leaders must be aware of the social, political, and economic forces that interact in the educational arena (Lopez, 2003).

The second attribute of effective bilingual education program is the creation of classroom climate (Berman et al., 1995; Carter & Chatfield, 1986; Lucas et al., 1990; Minicucci & Olson, 1992; Moll, 1988). In an effective bilingual education program, educators, students, parents, and community members place value on the linguistic and cultural background of Students, hold high expectations for their academic achievement, and ensure their integral involvement in the overall school operation (Lein et al., 1997; Ogbu & Matute-Bianchi, 1986). In order to develop classroom climate, Shields (2004) suggests educational leaders work within a guiding framework from which they can reflect on individual and collective actions and beliefs.

The third attribute of effective bilingual education program is program articulation. Educational leaders need to develop and maintain clearly articulated roles and responsibilities, dynamic two-way communication, and focused and sustained supports between central office and school-level staff that provide strong leadership, credibility, and respect (Howard & Christian, 2002; McLeod, 1996). A common program of instruction that is properly scoped, sequenced, and articulated across grade levels and has been aligned with developmentally appropriate practices and student language proficiency levels in English and the students' native language (McLeod, 1996; O'Malley and Valdez-Pierce, 1992) is also an important aspect of this attribute.

The fourth attribute of effective bilingual education program focuses on organization, accountability, and assessment. Researchers have found that effective schools use systematic assessment of student achievement to inform ongoing efforts to improve academic success (Carter & Chatfield, 1986; Goldenberg & Gallimore, 1991; Goldenberg & Sullivan, 1994; Slavin & Madden, 2001). The elementary bilingual education program is an integral part of the district and school academic plan and is widely respected by the administration. There is strong accountability for the success of all students (McLeod, 1996; Villarreal & Solís, 1998). While there has been much debate over the use of standardized assessments to determine the success of culturally and linguistically diverse students (Scheurich & Skrla, 2001; Valencia et al., 2001), the appropriate use of data can be a powerful tool in the assessment of the elementary bilingual education program.

The fifth attribute of effective bilingual education program is quality people. Quality people begin with screening teacher applicants to ensure full written and oral proficiency in both languages. Fully credentialed bilingual and EFL teachers are continuously acquiring new knowledge regarding best practices in curriculum, instruction, and assessment. These teachers also receive appropriate training in the students' native language (Lucas et al., 1990). All teachers in the school regularly receive information about bilingual education, the use of data, EFL strategies, and students' cultural and linguistic characteristics that serve as assets to their academic success (Berman et al., 1995).

The sixth attribute of effective bilingual education program centers on parental and community involvement. In an effective bilingual education program, all parents know the rationale and the critical components of the program and are strong advocates of the program (E. E. Garcia, 1991; McLeod, 1996). When parents establish partnerships with schools, they extend learning into the home and reinforce academic values outside school.

The seventh attribute of effective bilingual education program focuses on curriculum and instruction. Curriculum and instruction should emphasize functional communication between teachers and students and among fellow students, organize the instruction of basic skills and academic content around thematic units, and promote frequent student interaction through the use of collaborative learning techniques (E. E. Garcia, 1991). Teachers should supplement explicit skills instruction with student directed activities such as cooperative learning, partner reading, and collaborative inquiry. The classroom environment promotes high expectations for all students as evidenced by active learning environments that are meaningful, technologically appropriate, and academically challenging. Instruction is innovative and uses a variety of techniques that respond to different learning styles (McLeod, 1996).

METHOD

The site of this research was A Senior High School. The researcher choosed this school because the school is one of senior high school in Makassar, South Sulawesi Province, Indonesia, which implemented Bilingual education program, based on the researcher pre-observation, it is known that even though the school is about 6 years since it was running, but

the school has given many contributions and awards as one bilingual school. From 23 teachers of the school the researcher interviewed 3 of them namely English teacher, Economics teacher and Mathematics teacher, where those teachers are teaching their material on the class mostly using English than Indonesia. Interactive Model was used to analyze the qualitative data collected (Miles, Huberman, and Saldana 2014).

FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

A. Findings

1. English teacher's perceptions

a. Teacher's perceptions of program articulation

The teacher felt program articulation as the most important attribute of bilingual education program. The teacher mentioned the importance of a developmentally appropriate bilingual education program. The teacher mentioned: "I think they need to be using their Indonesian at home. I want them to use English, too, but in many cases, they cannot use English at home. Keeping their first language is so important and we need to have a good balance."

(Interviewed on January 29th, 2018)

The teacher commented, "The next important contributing factor to success is the consistency in the philosophy of how you teach an English Language Learner." The teacher shared concerns about the developmentally appropriateness of bilingual education program. The teacher commented: "I think we have just got to push these children to speak English. I think they are trying, I hear them in the hallway. I think the younger children are doing better."

(Interviewed on January 29th, 2018)

The teacher shared confirmations about the level of strong leadership, credibility, and respect for the program. The teacher commented: "There needs to be a real continued effort to help teachers understand and to continue to promote excellence and not just become frustrated. Good leaders will reinforce their ability to carry on the program. Even though they may be in trouble, if they continue to try, I think that is a very important part for principal to play."

(Interviewed on January 29th, 2018)

b. Teacher's perceptions of leadership, vision, and goals

The teacher felt leadership, vision, and goals, along with quality people, as the second most important attribute of bilingual education program. The teacher reported that it was important for the educational leadership to be well informed of the rationale for bilingual education. The teacher shared confirmations about the level of knowledge that principal had about the rationale for bilingual education. The teacher mentioned, "I think, first, a very strong knowledge of the research and purpose of bilingual education and second language acquisition."

(Interviewed on January 29th, 2018)

The teacher reported that it was important for the educational leadership to develop and articulate a clear vision and reported that it was important to involve the community in the development of the vision. The teacher shared confirmations regarding the development of the vision for bilingual education program. The teacher mentioned: "We need to have a strong plan, a strong focus. My friends are so sick of hearing me say this but you have to have a target and to be able to focus in on the target. We have to focus in like a laser, just very specific goals, targets find a way."

(Interviewed on January 29th, 2018)

c. Teacher's perceptions of quality people

The teacher felt quality people, along with leadership, vision, and goals, as the second most important attribute of bilingual education program. The teacher shared confirmations about the differences in the quality and preparation of bilingual teachers. The teacher mentioned, "The number one most important thing is quality teachers."

The teacher reported that it was important to provide all teachers in the school with information about bilingual education, the use of data, and EFL strategies that serve as assets to their academic success. One of the teacher confirmations about the differences in the level of understanding of regular education teachers included, "I think the teaching techniques for students for all of our teachers needs to be highlighted."

The teacher reported the importance of improving the recruitment, placement, professional development, and evaluation processes so that all students have access to a similar level of teacher quality. One of the teacher confirmations about the issues of recruitment and placement of teachers included: "I think I am open to suggestions on how we can attract and maintain really good teachers. They have mentioned that they are having a job fair and wanted me to be there to help with that. So, I think they are wanting to get the best people and maintain those people."

(Interviewed on January 29th, 2018)

d. Teacher's perceptions of parental and community involvement

The teacher felt parental and community involvement as the fourth most important attribute of bilingual education program. The teacher reported that it was essential to examine what is actually known their attitudes regarding education, and how they support their children's education through the family. The teacher confirmations about family culture included: "Many of these parents have never been to school or school very infrequently. Regular attendance, reinforcing what they have learned, embracing English or understand it. Backing up the teachers role by making sure the child understands that school is number one, they work hard they are reinforced by doing that. This is critically important for parents."

(Interviewed on January 29th, 2018)

The teacher also mentioned the importance of working with stakeholders to create community family centers that provide parental information and meeting places. The teacher confirmations about community education included: "I think that has been huge; it is highly attended by our parents. They are learning ways to help their child at home in terms of homework. We also ask them what they want."

(Interviewed on January 29th, 2018)

e. Teacher's perceptions of the creation of classroom climate

The teacher felt the creation of classroom climate as the third least important attribute of bilingual education program. The teacher mentioned that it was important for educators, students, parents, and community members to place value on the linguistic and cultural background of students. The shared confirmations about the differences in importance placed on respector language and culture. The teacher mentioned: "I feel that all children, they all have to have that sense of pride, that sense of confidence of who they are and their background. Everyone needs to be treated with dignity and respect. So, we need to honor each and every child and parent and honor that heritage. We do that about learning as much as we can about traditions."

(Interviewed on January 29th, 2018)

The teacher mentioned that the creation of a positive and safe classroom environment was a critical component of bilingual education program. The teacher shared confirmations about the differences between the climates at different schools and levels within the organization. The teacher mentioned: "We started a new discipline program this year. The students have to turn in all their homework; they have to make good grades. So, the kids that

would normally be in the office from office referrals because they couldn't care less about their homework, because no one at home could care less about it. They want to be in that soccer club."

(Interviewed on January 29th, 2018)

f. Teacher's perceptions of curriculum and instruction

The teacher felt curriculum and instruction as the second least important attribute of bilingual education program. The teacher felt that a philosophy of curriculum and instruction that capitalizes on the strengths of each child is an important part of bilingual education program. The teacher felt that it was important to promote high expectations for all students. The teacher suggested that a philosophy of curriculum and instruction that capitalizes on the strengths of each child promotes academic success for students. One of the teacher confirmations included, "Successful teachers understand what kids need and devise a program to meet that the needs of the child." The teacher confirmations included, "I use many visuals and hands on activities, lots of songs, poems, and rhymes that the children enjoy."

(Interviewed on January 29th, 2018)

g. Teacher's perceptions of organization, accountability, and assessment

The teacher felt organization, accountability, and assessment as the least important attribute of bilingual education program. The teacher mentioned the importance of strong accountability for the success of all students. One of the teacher confirmations about levels of accountability between and within the schools included: "At our school, we believe that there is no difference when you make decisions for children. We make the decisions consistently for all two groups. That is good for one group is good for the other. That consistency is really important, we only make decisions that will support all of the members on all of our school. That includes special education as well."

(Interviewed on January 29th, 2018)

The teacher reported that the use of systematic assessment of student achievement to inform ongoing efforts to improve academic success was important. The teacher confirmations about the role of assessment in the education of students included: "We have a really good handle; this year we have zoomed in our assessment practices to understand where our kids are academically and what to do to move them forward. That has dramatically changed this year."

(Interviewed on January 29th, 2018)

2. Economic teacher's perceptions

a. Teacher's perceptions of program articulation

The teacher felt program articulation as the most important attribute of bilingual education program. The teacher mentioned that it was important for bilingual education program to be aligned with developmentally appropriate practices and student language proficiency levels in English and the students' native languages. The teacher shared confirmations about the developmental appropriateness of bilingual education program. The teacher mentioned: "I feel that it is very important to maintain the primary language so that it can serve as a foundation for learning the foreign language. It is extremely important to me that the student becomes truly bilingual by being able to function in both languages when listening, speaking, reading, and writing. The ultimate goal is to teach the child English by building on Indonesian, ensuring a bilingual child."

(Interviewed on February 1st, 2018)

The teacher commented: "My views are that all of the students that have been in a consistent program will be successful. Development of a language begins with great

understanding of their native language first, since this is what they are coming with to the school setting. We need to use those skills first, then move them to a new language.”

(Interviewed on February 1st, 2018)

The teacher mentioned that it was important for bilingual education program to be properly scoped, sequenced, and articulated across grade levels. The teacher confirmations regarding the common program of instruction included, “One of the things that contribute the most to the academic success of students is collaboration with bilingual teachers within my grade level and other grade levels.” The teacher concerns regarding the common program of instruction included: “I feel that our program will improve because all the bilingual teachers in our school were on the same page. We must all be carrying out the same type of instruction that reflects our model so that we can ensure the academic success of our students.”

(Interviewed on February 1st, 2018)

b. Teacher’s perceptions of curriculum and instruction

The teacher felt curriculum and instruction, along with parental and community involvement attribute, as the second most important attribute of bilingual education program.

The teacher mentioned that supplementation of explicit skills instruction with student-centered activities such as cooperative learning and collaborative inquiry was a component of bilingual education program. One of the teacher confirmations included, “Cooperative learning, peer-teaching, large group instruction, and small group instruction contribute to the academic success of students.” The teacher commented, “Some of the strategies I use to ensure success for my students include modeling, small groups, whole group, read alouds, and conferencing.”

The teacher also mentioned that using a variety of innovative instructional techniques that respond to different learning styles was a component of bilingual education program. The teacher also mentioned, “I contribute to the academic success of my students by using a differentiated teaching approach. I must find a way to meet the needs of all students.”

(Interviewed on May 2nd, 2008)

c. Teacher’s perceptions of parental and community involvement

The teacher felt parental and community involvement, along with curriculum and instruction as the second most important attribute of bilingual education program.

The teacher mentioned that when parents and community establish partnerships with schools, they extend learning into the home and reinforce academic values outside school. The teacher confirmations included: “Parents already reach out to teachers as much as teachers need to reach out to them. There is no existing gaps between parents and teachers. Both need to meet students’ needs at school and at home. Parents also become more aware of what is going on in the school environment as well as what is being taught.”

(Interviewed on February 1st, 2018)

The teachers also mentioned that it was important for educators to examine what is actually known about their attitudes regarding education, and how they support their children’s education through the family.

The teacher mentioned that it was important to have community family centers that provide parental information and meeting places. The teacher shared confirmations about community education. The teacher mentioned: “I have parents in my classroom that are taking English courses themselves to learn to speak English. I think that this shows their children how important it is to learn English. By keeping them motivated and setting high expectations for their children. They need to truly believe that their children will be successful in whatever they decide to do”.

(Interviewed on February 1st, 2018)

d. Teacher’s perceptions of quality people

The teacher felt quality people as the third most important attribute of bilingual education program.

The teacher felt that it was important for all teachers in bilingual education program to regularly receive information about bilingual education and EFL strategies that serve as assets to their academic success. The teacher felt the importance of fully credentialed bilingual and EFL teachers to continuously acquire new knowledge regarding best practices in curriculum, instruction, and assessment.

The teacher felt that the improvement of recruitment, placement, professional development, and evaluation processes was important. The teacher felt that screening teacher applicants to ensure full written and oral proficiency in both languages was an important part of bilingual education program.

e. Teacher's perceptions of the creation of classroom climate

The teacher felt the creation of classroom climate as the third least important attribute of bilingual education program.

The teacher felt that bilingual education program placed value on the linguistic and cultural background of students. The teacher felt that it was important to provide students with equal access to a rigorous curriculum, accountability to the same academic standards, the opportunity to graduate from school in equal proportions, and the chance to leave school fully prepared to lead productive, successful, and fulfilling lives. The teacher felt that the creation of a positive and safe classroom environment was important.

The teacher mentioned that it was important for stakeholders to place value on the linguistic and cultural background of students. One of the teacher confirmations about the respect for culture and language included, "I believe that the native language should be used whenever possible, at home, in the store, and in the classroom. I believe that the students should be able to feel proud of their heritage and maintain their native language." Another teacher comment, "When school or classroom honors the child's home language, then it will be successful."

f. Teacher's perceptions of leadership, vision, and goals

The teacher felt leadership, vision, and goals as the second least important attribute of bilingual education program.

The teacher felt that bilingual education program had leader who were well informed of the rationale for bilingual education. The teacher felt that it was important for leader to share an active commitment to bilingualism. The teacher also felt the importance of leaders proactively involving teachers, the community, and the private sector in the design and development of the bilingual program. The teacher felt that it was important for leader to be open to innovation while raising questions about the systems, organizational frameworks, and leadership theories that privilege certain groups and/or perspectives over others.

g. Teacher's perceptions of organization, accountability, and assessment

The teacher felt organization, accountability, and assessment as the least important attribute of bilingual education program.

The teacher felt that it was important for the systematic assessment of student achievement to inform ongoing efforts in bilingual education program. The teacher also felt that strong accountability for the success of all students was important. The teacher felt that bilingual education program is an integral part of school academic plan.

The teacher mentioned that it was important to have systematic assessment of student achievement to inform ongoing efforts to improve academic success. The teacher confirmations regarding systematic and ongoing assessment included, "Our school has provide learners with immediate feedback during the learning process and constant readjustment and assessment of individual progress."

3. Mathematics teacher's perceptions

a. Teacher's perceptions of parental and community involvement

The teacher felt parental and community involvement as the most important attribute of bilingual education program.

The teacher mentioned that when parents and community establish partnerships with schools, they extend learning into the home and reinforce academic values outside school. The teacher confirmed about partnerships included, "Parent involvement is extremely important or they as parents fail. They cannot blame it on the teachers or on the students. There is a part that I have to do that no one else can do." The teacher mentioned, "I have to find time to help my students solve their problems. That is my point of view. I need to spend time with them and work with them when they are here." On the other hand, one of the teacher concerns about partnerships included, "I think that when parents do not get involved in the student's activities or their homework, then it is a problem."

The teacher also mentioned the importance of educators carefully examining what is actually known about their attitudes regarding education and how they support their students' education. The teacher mentioned: "the parents should spend time with their kids. Try to see what are their best talents and try to encourage and focus them in that direction, like sports and drawing."

(Interviewed on February 2nd, 2018)

b. Teacher's perceptions of the creation of classroom climate

The teacher felt the creation of classroom climate as the second most important attribute of bilingual education program.

Teacher felt that the creation of a positive and safe, classroom environment was an important part of bilingual education program. The teacher also felt that it was important to provide students with equal access to a rigorous curriculum, accountability to the same academic standards, the opportunity to graduate from school in equal proportions, and the chance to leave school fully prepared to lead productive, successful, and fulfilling lives.

The teacher mentioned that it was important for the climates to be positive and safe. The teacher confirm about the environment included: "The principal was good. He did all kinds of fun things. Some of students were having problems at the beginning but he found a way to encourage them with selfmanager motivation methods. Awards and gifts work with the students. The students have good grades and behave."

(Interviewed on February 2nd, 2018)

c. Teacher's perceptions of program articulation

The teacher felt program articulation as the third most important attribute of bilingual education program.

The teacher mentioned the importance of an bilingual education program that is aligned with developmentally appropriate practices and student language proficiency levels in English and the students' first language. The teacher confirm about the program included: "Another good thing that I think the bilingual teachers are doing well is that they encourage reading in both English and Indonesian. That happened to the students."

(Interviewed on February 2nd, 2018)

The teacher also mentioned that dynamic, two-way communication was an important component of the bilingual program. One of the teacher confirm about communication included: "The teachers lets you know if there is something wrong and we come to the school to talk to them. They send messages. That is the way they keep in touch."

(Interviewed on February 2nd, 2018)

The teacher mentioned: "The communication is very important to have to stay in touch with the students. It has worked very well for me in having very good communication and thank God, I have not had problems."

(Interviewed on February 2nd, 2018)

d. Teacher's perceptions of curriculum and instruction

The teacher felt curriculum and instruction as the third least important attribute of bilingual education program.

The teacher felt that active learning environments that were meaningful, technologically appropriate, and academically challenging were part of bilingual education program. The teacher also felt that using a variety of innovative instructional techniques that respond to different learning styles was important. The teacher felt the importance of promoting high expectations for all students. The teacher also felt that promoting frequent student interaction through collaborative learning techniques was important.

The teacher felt the importance of placing an emphasis on functional communication between teachers and students and among fellow students. The teacher also felt that a philosophy of curriculum and instruction that capitalizes on the strengths of each student was important. The teacher felt that an educationally productive balance between commonality and diversity in heterogeneous schools and classrooms was a part of bilingual education program.

e. Teacher's perceptions of quality people

The teacher felt quality people as the second least important attribute of bilingual education program.

The teacher felt that fully credentialed bilingual and EFL teachers continuously acquiring new knowledge regarding best practices in curriculum, instruction, and assessment was part of bilingual education program. The teacher felt the importance of screening teacher applicants to ensure full written and oral proficiency in both languages. Teacher felt that the improvement of recruitment, placement, professional development, and evaluation processes was important. The teacher felt that all educators receiving appropriate training in the students' native language was an important part of bilingual education program.

f. Teacher's perceptions of leadership, vision, and goals

The teacher felt leadership, vision, and goals, along with organization, accountability, and assessment, as the least important attribute of bilingual education program.

The teacher felt the importance of leaders proactively involving teachers, the community, and the private sector in the design and development of bilingual education program. The teacher felt that it was important for leaders to publish and disseminate information so that staff, parents, and students can articulate the purpose of the school in their own words. The teacher felt that it was important to create a vision and set of goals with the school community and define high expectations of all students. The teacher also felt that leaders who were well informed of the rationale for bilingual education and shared an active commitment to bilingualism were important.

g. Teacher's perceptions of organization, accountability, and assessment

The teacher felt organization, accountability, and assessment, along with leadership, vision, and goals, as the least important attribute of bilingual education program.

The teacher felt that strong accountability for the success of all students was an important part of bilingual education program. The teacher felt that it was important for the systematic assessment of student achievement to inform ongoing efforts.

The teacher mentioned that it was important to have strong accountability for the success of all students in bilingual education program. One of the teacher concerns included: "The teachers here will just be strict and demanding but just because they have to reach some goals. They should be applying their methods because they know it will work at some point as a teaching tool. They should be strict to improve the students not to pass the test."

B. Discussion

The teachers' perceptions were combined and coded by the researcher as they related to the components of the seven attributes of bilingual education program. These seven attributes included: (a) leadership, vision, and goals; (b) district, school, and classroom climate; (c) program articulation; (d) organization, accountability, and assessment; (e) quality people; (f) parental and community involvement; and (g) curriculum and instruction.

The perceptions of the participants regarding leadership, vision, and goals are consistent with research which found that educational leaders who are well informed of the rationale for bilingual education and share an active commitment to bilingualism are critical to the effective schooling of English Language Learners. (Carter & Chatfield, 1986; E. E. Garcia, 1991; Goldenberg & Sullivan, 1994; Lucas et al., 1990; Tikunoff et al., 1991). The participant perceptions regarding leadership, vision, and goals are also congruent with research which found that one of the primary roles of leadership in an effective elementary bilingual education program is to create a vision and set of goals with the school community that define high expectations of all students. Furthermore, leaders publish and disseminate these high expectations so that staff, parents, and students can articulate the purpose of the school in their own words (Robledo Montecel, Cortez, Cortez et al., 2002; Villarreal & Solís, 1998).

The teachers' perceptions regarding the creation of classroom climate are consistent with prior research which found that educators, students, parents, and community members in bilingual education programs place value on the linguistic and cultural background of the students, hold high expectations for their academic achievement, and ensure their integral involvement in the overall school operation (Lein et al., 1997; Ogbu & Matute-Bianchi, 1986).

The teachers' perceptions regarding program articulation are supported by researchers who found that bilingual education programs are characterized by the development and maintenance of clearly articulated roles and responsibilities, dynamic two-way communication, and focused and sustained supports between central office and school-level staff that provide strong leadership, credibility, and respect (Howard & Christian, 2002; McLeod, 1996).

The teachers' perceptions regarding organization, accountability, and assessment are supported by research which found that effective programs use systematic assessment of student achievement to inform ongoing efforts to improve academic success (Carter & Chatfield, 1986; Goldenberg & Gallimore, 1991; Goldenberg & Sullivan, 1994; Slavin & Madden, 2001; Slavin & Yampolsky, 1991). The perceptions of the participants regarding quality people are supported by research which found that bilingual and monolingual educators in bilingual education programs continuously acquire new knowledge regarding best practices in curriculum, instruction, and assessment to improve teaching and learning for English Language Learners (Berman et al., 1995; Milk et al., 1992; Minicucci & Olson, 1992; Villarreal, 1999).

The perceptions of the teachers' regarding parental and community involvement are congruent with research which found that when parents and community members know the rationale and the critical components of bilingual programs, they also become strong advocates of the program (E. E. Garcia, 1991; McLeod, 1996; Moll et al., 1992; Robledo Montecel et al., 1993). The teachers' perceptions regarding parental and community involvement are also revealed that bilingual education programs establish partnerships with parents and the community to extend learning into the home and reinforce academic values outside school..

The teachers' perceptions regarding curriculum and instruction are congruent with research on bilingual education programs that supports active learning environments that are meaningful, technologically appropriate, and academically challenging (Collier, 1992; Goldenberg & Sullivan, 1994; Lucas et al., 1990; Pease-Alvarez et al., 1991).

CONCLUSION

The English teacher felt program articulation as the most important attribute of bilingual education program. The teacher felt leadership, vision, and goals and quality people as the second most important attributes. Followed by the parental and community involvement, creation of classroom climate, and curriculum and instruction attributes. The teacher felt organization, accountability, and assessment as the least important attribute of bilingual education program. Economic teacher felt program articulation as the most important attribute of the bilingual education program. The teacher felt parental and community involvement and curriculum and instruction as the second most important attributes. Followed by the quality people, creation of classroom climate, and leadership, vision, and goals attributes. The teacher felt organization, accountability, and assessment as the least important attribute of bilingual education program. Math teacher felt parental and community involvement as the most important attribute of bilingual education program. The teacher felt the creation of classroom climate and program articulation as the second and third most important attributes, followed by the curriculum and instruction and quality people attributes. The teacher felt organization, accountability, and assessment and leadership, vision, and goals as the least attributes of bilingual education program.

From the teachers' perception data about the attributes of Bilingual Education Program, the researcher can identify three categories that can be used of the teacher characteristics assessed effectively competent, namely:

1. Highly Effective Teachers on Bilingual Education Program (HETBEP), with the indicators:
 - a. emphasizing functional communication between teachers and students and among fellow students;
 - b. organizing the instruction of skills and academic content around thematic units;
 - c. promoting frequent student interaction through collaborative learning techniques.
2. Moderately Effective Teacher on Bilingual education Program (METBEP), with the indicators:
 - a. using limited instructional techniques that respond to different learning styles;
 - b. rarely seeking an educationally productive balance between commonality and diversity in heterogeneous schools and classrooms;
 - c. rarely promoting a philosophy of curriculum and instruction that capitalizes on the strengths of each child;
3. Low Effective Teachers on Bilingual Education Program (LETBEP), with the indicators:
 - a. is not well informed of the rationale for bilingual education;
 - b. do not share an active commitment to bilingualism;
 - c. are not open to innovation;

REFERENCES

- August, D., & Hakuta, K. 1998. *Educating Language-Minority Children*. Washington, DC: National Academy Press.
- Berman, P., McLaughlin, B., McLeod, B., Minicucci, C., Nelson, B., & Woodworth, K. (1995). *School Reform and Student Diversity: Case Studies of Exemplary Practices for English Language Learner Students*. Berkeley, CA: National Center for Research on Cultural Diversity and Second Language Learning.
- Bialystok, E. 2001. *Bilingualism in Development: Language, Literacy, and Cognition*. New York: Cambridge University Press.

- Carter, T., & Chatfield, M. 1986. *Effective Bilingual Schools: Implications for Policy and Practice*. American Journal of Education.
- Collier, V. P. 1992. *A Synthesis of Studies Examining Long-Term Language Minority Student Data on Academic Achievement*. Bilingual Research Journal.
- Cummins, J. 1999. *Research, Ethics, and Public Discourse: The Debate on Bilingual Education*. Washington, DC.
- Garcia, E. E. 1991. *Education of Linguistically and Culturally Diverse Students: Effective Instructional Practices*. Washington, DC: National Center for Research of Cultural Diversity and Second Language Learning.
- Ginsburg, H. and I. McCoy. 1981. *An Empirical Rationale for Foreign Language in Elementary Schools*. Modern Language Journal.
- Goldenberg, C., & Gallimore, R. 1991. *Local Knowledge, Research Knowledge, and Educational Change: A Case Study of Early Spanish Reading Improvement*. Educational Researcher.
- Goldenberg, C., & Sullivan, J. 1994. *Making Change Happen In a Language-Minority School: A Search for Coherence*. Washington, DC.
- Hakuta, K., & R.M. Diaz. 1985. *The Relationship between Degree of Bilingualism and Cognitive Ability: A Critical Discussion*.
- Hancock, C. and G. Lipton, et al. 1976. *A study of FLES and non FLES Pupils' Attitudes Toward the French and Their Culture*. French Review .
- Howard, E. R., Sugarman, J., & Christian, D. 2003. *Trends in Two-Way Immersion Education: A Review of the Research*. Baltimore, MD: Center for Research on the Education of Students Placed At Risk.
- Kincheloe, J. L., & Steinberg, S. R. 1995. *The More Questions We Ask, The More Questions We Ask*. In J. L. Kincheloe & S. R. Steinberg (Eds.), New York, NY: Peter Lang.
- Krashen, S. 2000. *Bilingual education, the acquisition of English, and the retention and loss of Spanish*. In A. Roca (Ed.), *Research on Spanish in the U.S.* Somerville, MA: Cascadilla Press.
- Lambert, Wallace and Tucker, G. Richard, 1972. *Bilingual Education for Children*. Rowley, Mass: Newbury House Publishers.
- Lein, L., Johnson, J. F., & Ragland, M. 1997. *Successful Texas School Wide Programs: Research Study Results*. Austin, TX: The Charles A. Dana Center at the University of Texas at Austin.
- Lopez, G. 2003. *The (Racially Neutral) Politics of Education: A Critical Race Theory Perspective*. *Educational Administration Quarterly*.
- Lucas, T., Henze, R. C., & Donato, R. 1990. *Promoting the Success of Latino Language Minority Students: An Exploratory Study of Six High Schools*. Harvard Educational Review.
- Masciantonio, R. 1977. *Tangible Benefits of the Study of Latin: A Review of Research*. *Foreign Language Annals*.
- McLeod, B. 1996. *School Reform and Student Diversity: Exemplary Schooling for Language Minority Students*. Washington, DC: National Clearinghouse for Bilingual Education.
- Miles M.T, Huberman A.M, & Saldana, J. 2014. *Qualitative Data Analysis. A Methods Source Book*. Arizona State University. Third Edition.
- Milk, R., Mercado, C., & Sapiens, A. 1992. *Re-thinking the education of teachers of language minority children: Developing reflective teachers for changing schools*. Washington, DC: National Clearinghouse for Bilingual Education.

- Minicucci, C., & Olson, L. 1992. *Programs for Secondary Limited English Proficient Students: A California Study*. Washington, DC.
- Moll, L. C. 1988. *Key issues in teaching Latino students*. Language Arts.
- Moran, C. & K. Hakuta. 1995. *Bilingual education: Broadening research perspectives*. In J.A. Banks & C.A.M. Banks (Eds.), *Handbook of research on multicultural education*. New York: Macmillan.
- Ogbu, J. U., & Matute-Bianchi, M. E. 1986. *Understanding Sociocultural Factors: Knowledge, Identity, and School Adjustment*. In C. S. D. O. Education (Ed.), *Beyond Language: Social And Cultural Factors In Schooling Language-Minority Students*. Los Angeles, CA.
- O'Malley, J.M., and L. Valdez Pierce. 1992. *Performance and Portfolio Assessment for Language Minority Students*. Washington, D.C.: National Clearinghouse for Bilingual Education.
- Pease-Alvarez, L., Garcia, E., & Espinosa, P. 1991. *Effective instruction for language minority students: An early childhood case study*. Early Childhood Research Quarterly.
- Rafferty, E.A. 1986. *Second Language Study and Basic Skills in Louisiana* Baton Rouge, LA.
- Rennie, J. 1993. *EFL and Bilingual Program Models*. On line at <http://www.cal.org/ericcl/digest/rennie01.html>. Retrieved on December 13, 2017.
- Robertson, R. 2008. *Globalization. Social Theory and Global Culture*. London: Sage.
- Robledo Montecel, M., Cortez, J. D., & Cortez, A. 2002. *What is valuable and contributes to success in bilingual education programs*. San Antonio, TX: Intercultural Development Research Association.
- Saxe, G. B. 1983. *Linking Language with Mathematics Achievement: Problems and Prospects*. Washington D.C: National Institute of Education.
- Shields, C. M. 2004. *Dialogic Leadership for Social Justice: Overcoming Pathologies of Silence*. Educational Administration Quarterly.
- Skrla, L., Scheurich, J. J., Garcia, J., & Nolly, G. 2004. *Equity Audits: A Practical Leadership Tool for Developing Equitable and Excellent Schools*.
- Slavin and Nancy A Madden, 2010, *Reducing the Gap : Success for All and the Achievement of African American Students*. The Journal of Negro Education. Vo. 75.
- Smith, M. K., & Doyle, M. E. 2007. Globalization. infed encyclopedia. Available from: <<http://www.infed.org/biblio/globalization.htm>> [Accessed January 07, 2017].
- TEA. 2000. *Study of Possible Expansion of the Assessment System for Limited English Proficient Students*. Austin, TX: Texas Education Agency.
- Tikunoff, W., Ward, B., van Broekhuizen, D., Romero, M., Castaneda, L. V., Lucas, T., et al. 1991. *A Descriptive Study of Significant Features of Exemplary Special Alternative Instructional Programs*. Washington, DC: U. S. Department of Education.
- Valencia, R. R., Valenzuela, A., Sloan, K., & Foley, D. E. 2001. *Let's Treat The Cause, Not The Symptoms: Equity And Accountability In Texas Revisited*.
- Villarreal, A., & Solís, A. 1998. *Effective Implementation of Bilingual Programs: Reflections from The Field*. San Antonio, TX: Intercultural Development Research Association.